

KINGS LAW REPORTS

(ALL SC/NOVEL CA)

(2007) KLR VOL 1 PART 228 pp. 159 - 624

JANUARY 2007

Dedicated to the King of kings

O. O. NOEL ESQ. Chief Editor

INDEX OF CASES REPORTED

JANUARY CONTD.

6. Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159
7. Adetoun Oladeji Nigeria Limited v. Nigerian Breweries Plc p. 217
8. Co-Operative & Commerce Bank Plc v. Ekperi p. 243
9. Gbadamosi v. Dairo p. 263
10. Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291
11. Mafimisebi v. Ehuwa p. 539
12. Universal Trust Bank of Nigeria v. Ozoemena p. 585

ii INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2007) 1 KLR

ACTIONS - Commencement - Originating summons - Is used in commencing proceedings - Where facts are not in dispute - The cynosure is applicable law and its construction (H1) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

ACTIONS - Competence of plaintiff - Removal of Governor - Speaker of the House of Assembly - In view of his constitutional responsibilities - Has sufficient interest - To complain vide an action - On the breach of s.188 1999 Constitution (H14) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

ACTIONS - Jurisdiction - Relevance of - Tool for its determination - Is the plaintiff's case - Which where commenced by originating summons - Supporting affidavit should be considered (H5) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

ACTIONS - Jurisdiction - Striking out - Where a court holds that it has no jurisdiction - It should strike out the action - And not dismiss it - Since dismissal should flow from adjudication on the merits (H2) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

ACTIONS - Locus standi - Meaning - Party who seeks declaratory relief under the Constitution - Must show vide his statement of claim - That he has a substantial Constitutional interest - That is violated or breached to his detriment (H13) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

ACTIONS - Reliefs not claimed - Bailment - Where not claimed by either party - Court of Appeal was wrong - In introducing the issue and resolving it suo motu (H5) Adetoun O. Nig. Ltd v. Nigerian Breweries Plc p. 217

APPEALS - Court of Appeal Act s.16 - Jurisdiction - Of the High Court - Is a precondition - For invocation of the section - The real question in controversy - Must be a ground of appeal - Before Court of Appeal can invoke s.16 (H18) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

APPEALS - Court of Appeal's power - Under s.16 of the Act - Purpose of the section - Speedy administration of justice - Sufficient materials

abound - To enable Court of Appeal invoke s.16 - In deciding the real question in controversy (H19) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

APPEALS - Interference - Concurrent findings - That are not perverse or erroneous - Will not be interfered with by the Supreme Court (H4) Gbadamosi v. Dairo p. 263

APPEALS - Issues - Ground of appeal - Mortgages - Complaint in the sole ground of appeal - Does not relate to Court of Appeal's decision - And shall be struck out - For being incompetent (H2) CCB Plc v. Ekperi p. 243

APPEALS - Issues - Jurisdiction - Where an issue was not determined by the Court of Appeal - And no leave was obtained - Supreme Court lacks Jurisdiction to entertain it (H6) Gbadamosi v. Dairo p. 263

APPEALS - Issues - Not appealed against - But pronounced on - By intermediate appeal court - Such issues cannot be subject of further appeal - And remain open to argument - As points of law to any further appeal (H2) Mafimisebi v. Ehuwa p. 539

APPEALS - Issues - Relevant issue before lower Court - Was duly resolved by it - In its judgment (H1) CCB Plc v. Ekperi p. 243

APPEALS - Jurisdiction - Limits - Every Statute that vests power on a court - Has a limit - S.16 Court of Appeal Act - Was rightly invoked in this case - As there was no fact that limited its application (H20) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

APPEALS - Notice of appeal - Validity - Where the original notice is invalid - It cannot be resuscitated - By filing subsequent valid additional grounds (H4) CCB Plc v. Ekperi p. 243

APPEALS - Reversal - Mistake in a judgment - That did not occasion miscarriage of justice - Will not warrant a reversal of that decision (H7)

iv INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2007) 1 KLR

Gbadamosi v. Dairo p. 263

APPEALS - Variation of judgment - Damages - Judicial precedents - Ngwu case as to role of appeal court - Supports present correction of trial court's error - By the Court of Appeal (H3) Adetoun O. Nig. Ltd v. Nigerian Breweries Plc p. 217

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Appeals - Technicalities - Removal of Governor - The manner some State Assemblies have made it like a child's play - Calls for an arrest - Vide court's pursuit of doing substantial justice (H26) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Arms of government - Checks and balances - The Legislature should not desecrate the Constitution - As the judiciary is alive to check acts of violation (H27) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Courts - Jurisdiction - Ouster clauses - How regarded by the judicial system - Wrong procedure adopted - In removal of Governor - Is outside s. 188(10) 1999 Constitution - An ouster clause (H10) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Impeachment - S. 188(1) & (2) 1999 Constitution - Meaning - As the word is not used and has very wide meaning - The proper word is removal from office (H3) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Jurisdiction - Judicial precedents - Removal of Governor - Some conditions must be fulfilled - Before court will decline jurisdiction under s. 188(10) 1999 Constitution - And the case of Abaribe - Is not applicable in this matter (H7) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Legislation - Removal of Governor - House of Assembly - Place of sitting - Should be the building provided for that purpose - Not a hotel - As it is not a secret cult (H12) Inakoju v. Adeleke

p. 291

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Ouster clause - Removal of Governor - Procedure & proceedings - Difference in the two words - S. 188(10) 1999 Constitution - Is an ouster clause on proceedings - And does not affect the procedure spelt out in s. 188(1) - (6) (H9) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Removal of Governor - Locus standi - Rule in Foss v. Harbottle - Cannot apply in a case on breach of the Constitution - Speaker, deputy speaker and members of the House of Assembly - Have locus to commence action - Upon breach of s.188 1999 Constitution (H15) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Removal of Governor - S. 188 1999 Constitution - Basis - Should be for gross misconduct - Not political or vendetta purpose (H4) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Removal of Governor - S. 188 1999 Constitution - Outline of acts of breach of the section by appellants - Breach of one condition is enough - To make a court hold that the procedure is unconstitutional (H11) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Stare decisis - Foreign cases - Are only persuasive - Cases based on USA Constitution on impeachment - Are not applicable to our removal of Governor provisions - As the facts are not the same (H8) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CONTRACTS - Terms - Proper construction of - Court is not to make agreement for parties - Though it may fall back on the intention - Behind the words used - Where their meaning are not clear (H1) Adetoun O. Nig. Ltd v. Nigerian Breweries Plc p. 217

COURTS - Appeals - Retrial - Propriety of - Where an appellate court - Finds that trial court failed - To consider relevant and available evidence

vi INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2007) 1 KLR

- It should consider the evidence - And make proper finding - Rather than remit case back for retrial (H5) Mafimisebi v. Ehuwa p. 539

COURTS - Error - Title - Pleadings - Trial court wrongfully granted defendant a reprieve - For his failure to plead and prove his title - To the land in dispute (H5) Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

COURTS - Issues - Title - Status of disputed land - Finding on it was irrelevant - In view of defendant's admission (H6) Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

COURTS - Judgments - Mistake - Issues - Isolation of issues for determination by court - Cannot amount to a consent judgment- Referential mistake by lower court - Caused no miscarriage of justice (H2) Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

COURTS - Justice - Meaning - Role of a judge - Is to do justice between the parties - That is substantial justice - That is not sacrificed at the altar of technicality (H25) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

CUSTOMARY LAW - Chieftaincy declarations - Promulgation of - Powers of court - Courts cannot promulgate chieftaincy declarations - But may pronounce - On validity of such declarations - On the basis of prevailing customary law (H3) Mafimisebi v. Ehuwa p. 539

DAMAGES - Reduction - Appeals - Evidence - As to yearly profit of appellant - Though not challenged - Its proper effect - Is to award one month profit as damages - As properly done by Court of Appeal (H2) Adetoun O. Nig. Ltd v. Nigerian Breweries Plc p. 217

EVIDENCE - Admissibility - House of Assembly proceedings - Oral evidence - Where cogent and relevant - No need for documentary evidence - Draft rules need not be exhibited in an affidavit - Before court can take judicial notice of them (H16) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

EVIDENCE - Affidavits - Counter affidavit - Normally follows an affidavit as a matter of course - Save where a party has no evidence - That can silence that affidavit (H24) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

EVIDENCE - Affidavits - Nature - Objection against some depositions - As not complying with the Evidence Act - Is not tenable - And the objection being new - Leave of court ought to be obtained (H17) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

EVIDENCE - Evaluation - Title to land - Where trial court properly evaluated the evidence - Appellate court will not substitute its own views - For that of trial court (H3) Gbadamosi v. Dairo p. 263

EVIDENCE - Evaluation of - Duty of court - Court has a duty - To evaluate all evidence - Relevant to an issue - Before resolving the issue - Failure to so do - Amounts to breach of fair hearing (H4) Mafimisebi v. Ehuwa p. 539

JUDGMENTS - Dissatisfaction - Appeals - Findings of trial court - Where a party is dissatisfied therewith - His only remedy is to appeal or cross appeal (H23) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

JUDGMENTS - Judicial precedents - Decisions of English or foreign courts - Are not binding on Nigerian courts - But are of persuasive authority (H6) Adetoun O. Nig. Ltd v. Nigerian Breweries Plc p. 217

JUDICIAL PRECEDENTS - Stare decisis - Meaning - Facts that give rise to the principle - Are the material facts - So that the relevant ratio in Mobil Case - Was properly applied by lower court (H4) Adetoun O. Nig. Ltd v. Nigerian Breweries Plc p. 217

JURISDICTION - Determination of - Evidence may or may not be taken - Where it is in relation to a constitutional provision - Totality of the section not mere subsections - Must be considered (H6) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

LAND LAW - Customary tenancy - Forfeiture - Challenge to landlord's title - Grounds forfeiture - But considering the equity involved - Forfeiture may not be granted by the Supreme Court (H9) Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

LAND LAW - Issues - Identity of the land - Where not made an issue by the defendant - Court will not make it a triable issue (H2) Gbadamosi v. Dairo p. 263

LAND LAW - Sale - Customary law - Requirements for a valid sale under customary law - Include actual handing over of the land - In the witnesses' presence (H4) Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

LAND LAW - Title - Customary tenancy - Long possession of defendant - Cannot defeat his landlord's ownership - Plaintiff is entitled to declaration of title - In this case (H8) Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

LAND LAW - Title - Customary tenancy - Nature of - Fact of not paying rents - Does not lead to conclusive fact - Of ownership of the land (H7) Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

LAND LAW - Title - Identity of the land - Burden of proof is on plaintiff - And failure to prove exact identity of the land being claimed - Will ground dismissal of the action (H1) Gbadamosi v. Dairo p. 263

LAND LAW - Title - Location of the land in dispute - Finding of trial court - As confirmed by the Court of Appeal - Is correct (H5) Gbadamosi v. Dairo p. 263

LAND LAW - Title - Pleadings - Admission - Where a defendant admitted that the land in dispute - Previously belonged to plaintiff - Onus of proof of transfer of title to him - Is cast upon that defendant (H3) Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

LEGISLATION - Parliamentary action - Power to suspend its rules - Where exercised mala fide - It will be deemed illegal and unconstitutional (H22) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

MORTGAGES - Issues - Interpretation of a mortgage - Is different from an issue as to its validity or existence - Seeing that the later issue - Questions existence of any legal rights (H3) CCB Plc v. Ekperi p. 243

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Pleadings - Issues - Emergence of - An issue in civil proceedings emerges - Where court upon comparison of the averments - Identifies the matters really in dispute - Evidence on undisputed matters is unnecessary (H1) Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

STATUTES - Constitution - Specific provision - Removal of Governors - Specific provision of s.188(9) - Will prevail over general provision - Of s.102 1999 Constitution (H21) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

TORTS - Negligence - Definition - Means lack of proper care - It is complete when three conditions are satisfied - Including breach of duty of care (H1) Universal Trust Bank v. Ozoemena p. 585

TORTS - Negligence - Duty of care - Parties that have common boundary - Separated by a wall - Owe duty of care to each other (H3) Universal Trust Bank v. Ozoemena p. 585

TORTS - Negligence - Pleadings - To succeed - Plaintiff must show the duty of care owed to him and the breach - Which duty must be actionable - And not a moral liability (H4) Universal Trust Bank v. Ozoemena p. 585

TORTS - Negligence - Proof - Fire outbreak - As plaintiff failed to prove that appellant caused the fire - That destroyed her building - Appellant is not liable in negligence - As wrongfully found by lower courts (H5) Universal Trust Bank v. Ozoemena p. 585

x INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2007) 1 KLR

TORTS - Negligence - Proof - What amounts to negligence - Is decided in the light of facts of each case - Plaintiff must plead all the particulars - supported by credible evidence (H2) Universal Trust Bank v. Ozoemena p. 585

WORDS & PHRASES - Null and void - Set aside - Legal effect - Something declared null and void - Ceases to be in existence - Just as something set aside - As such both concepts - Are the same in law (H1) Mafimisebi v. Ehuwa p. 539

INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES

Chieftaincy Edict of Ondo State No. 11 1984 s. 5(2) Mafimisebi v. Ehuwa p. 539

Constitution of Nigeria 1979 s.170 Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

Constitution of Nigeria 1999 ss.188, 4(8), 241(1), 36(1), 92(1), 94(2), 191(1), 104, 108(1), 92(2)(c), 188(9), 101, 102, 315(3), 242(1), 240

Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291; s. 233(2) & (3) CCB Plc v. Ekperi p. 243

Court of Appeal Act ss.16, 25 Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

Court of Appeal Rules O.6 r.4(2) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

Evidence Act ss. 73, 74, 86, 88, 89, 113, 74(1)(c) Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291; ss. 74, 139, 135, 136 Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

Interpretation Act Cap. 192 LFN 1990 s.15 Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291

Oyo State High Court (Civil Procedure) Rules O.24, O.27 r.8 Inakoju v. Adeleke p. 291; O.35 rr. 1-4 Adedeji v. Oloso p. 159

Supreme Court Act, s.22 Mafimisebi v. Ehuwa p. 539

Supreme Court Rules, O.6, r.12 Mafimisebi v. Ehuwa p. 539

Torts Law of Anambra State 1986 Cap. 135, ss. 217, 218, 251, 254

Universal Trust Bank v. Ozoemena p. 585